IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA CIVIL MINUTES - JURY TRIAL DAY 12

Phoenix Division

MDL 15-2641-PHX-DGC DATE: 10/3/2018

Year Case No Initials

Title: IN RE: Bard IVC Filters Products Liability Litigation

HON: DAVID G. CAMPBELL

Traci C. Abraham Patricia Lyons/Jennifer Pancratz

Deputy Clerk Court Reporter

APPEARANCES:

Mark O'Connor, Ramon Lopez, Julia Reed-Zaic, Paul Stoller, Laura Smith, Stuart Goldenberg, Mark Chavez

Attorney(s) for Plaintiff(s)

James Condo, Elizabeth Helm, James Rogers, Richard North, Candace Camarate Attorney(s) for Defendant(s)

PROCEEDINGS: X Jury Trial DAY 12

3rd Bellwether Trial- Plaintiffs Lisa Hyde and Mark Hyde- Present

8:30 Court is in session. Parties are present. Court ruling on proposed jury instructions Doc. 12810 discussed. Plaintiff objections discussed. 8:41 Court is in recess.

9:00 Court is in session. Parties are present. Jury is present. 9:02 Michael Randall called and examined. Exhibit 5967,5384,5934,8575,8574,8546,8358 admitted. Exhibit 8482 demonstrative and displayed to jury. 10:32 Court is in recess.

10:46 Court is in session. Parties are present. Jury is present Michael Randall examination continues. 11:11 Defendant rest. 11:12 Plaintiff rebuttal. Exhibit 932 admitted. 11:13 Plaintiff rest. 11:14 Jury excused. 11:15 Plaintiff oral motion for Rule 50(a) argued. Motion is denied. Final jury instructions and verdict form discussed. Defendant renews Rule 50 motion with an additional Rule 50 as to past medical expenses. Motion argued. Motion is under advisement. 11:55 Jury present and excused until 1:00 p.m. 11:56 Court is in recess.

12:56 Court is in recess. Parties are present. Defendant's Rule 50 motion as to past medical expenses is granted for the reasons stated on the record. Final jury instructions discussed. 1:08 Jury is present. Final jury instructions read. 1:49 Plaintiff's closing argument. 2:53 Court is in recess.

Case 2:15-md-02641-DGC Document 12839 Filed 10/03/18 Page 2 of 2

Page 2 MDL 15-2641 PHX DGC Hyde Trial 10/3/2018

3:10 Court is in session. Parties are present. Jury is present. Defendant's closing argument. 4:21 Plaintiff rebuttal.4:35 Bailiffs are sworn and jury retire to begin deliberations. 4:37 Court is in recess.

Jury deliberations continues on 10/4/2018 at 9:00 a.m.